

PROCEEDINGS OF SPIE

The Nature of Light: What Are Photons?

Chandrasekhar Roychoudhuri
Al F. Kracklauer
Katherine Creath
Editors

26–27 August 2007
San Diego, California, USA

Sponsored by
SPIE

Cosponsored by
NSG—Nippon Sheet Glass Company, Ltd. (Japan)
Off The Record Research (USA)

Published by
SPIE

Volume 6664

Proceedings of SPIE, 0277-786X, v. 6664

SPIE is an international society advancing an interdisciplinary approach to the science and application of light.

The papers included in this volume were part of the technical conference cited on the cover and title page. Papers were selected and subject to review by the editors and conference program committee. Some conference presentations may not be available for publication. The papers published in these proceedings reflect the work and thoughts of the authors and are published herein as submitted. The publisher is not responsible for the validity of the information or for any outcomes resulting from reliance thereon.

Please use the following format to cite material from this book:

Author(s), "Title of Paper," in *The Nature of Light: What Are Photons?*, edited by Chandrasekhar Roychoudhuri, Al F. Kracklauer, Katherine Creath, Proceedings of SPIE Vol. 6664 (SPIE, Bellingham, WA, 2007) Article CID Number.

ISSN 0277-786X
ISBN 9780819468123

Published by

SPIE

P.O. Box 10, Bellingham, Washington 98227-0010 USA
Telephone +1 360 676 3290 (Pacific Time) · Fax +1 360 647 1445
SPIE.org

Copyright © 2007, Society of Photo-Optical Instrumentation Engineers

Copying of material in this book for internal or personal use, or for the internal or personal use of specific clients, beyond the fair use provisions granted by the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized by SPIE subject to payment of copying fees. The Transactional Reporting Service base fee for this volume is \$18.00 per article (or portion thereof), which should be paid directly to the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Payment may also be made electronically through CCC Online at copyright.com. Other copying for republication, resale, advertising or promotion, or any form of systematic or multiple reproduction of any material in this book is prohibited except with permission in writing from the publisher. The CCC fee code is 0277-786X/07/\$18.00.

Printed in the United States of America.

Publication of record for individual papers is online in the SPIE Digital Library.


SPIEDigitalLibrary.org

Paper Numbering: Proceedings of SPIE follow an e-First publication model, with papers published first online and then in print and on CD-ROM. Papers are published as they are submitted and meet publication criteria. A unique, consistent, permanent citation identifier (CID) number is assigned to each article at the time of the first publication. Utilization of CIDs allows articles to be fully citable as soon they are published online, and connects the same identifier to all online, print, and electronic versions of the publication. SPIE uses a six-digit CID article numbering system in which:

- The first four digits correspond to the SPIE volume number.
- The last two digits indicate publication order within the volume using a Base 36 numbering system employing both numerals and letters. These two-number sets start with 00, 01, 02, 03, 04, 05, 06, 07, 08, 09, 0A, 0B ... 0Z, followed by 10-1Z, 20-2Z, etc.

The CID number appears on each page of the manuscript. The complete citation is used on the first page, and an abbreviated version on subsequent pages. Numbers in the index correspond to the last two digits of the six-digit CID number.

Contents

| | |
|-----|-----------------------------|
| vii | <i>Conference Committee</i> |
| ix | <i>Introduction</i> |

SESSION 1 INFORMATION AND WAVE-PARTICLE DUALITY

- 6664 02 **The inexhaustible source of insights revealed by every photon (Invited Paper)** [6664-36]
A. C. Elitzur, Weizmann Institute of Science (Israel); S. Dolev, Haifa Univ. (Israel)
- 6664 03 **What is the information in a photon? (Invited Paper)** [6664-01]
S. Kak, Louisiana State Univ. (USA)
- 6664 04 **Can a deeper understanding of the measured behavior of light remove wave-particle duality?** [6664-02]
C. Roychoudhuri, Univ. of Connecticut (USA)
- 6664 05 **Can we get any better information about the nature of light by comparing radio and light wave detection processes?** [6664-12]
C. Roychoudhuri, Univ. of Connecticut (USA) and Femto Macro Continuum (USA);
P. Poulos, Manchester Community College (USA)
- 6664 06 **Photons as beat frequency envelopes** [6664-03]
D. Maker, Photon Research (USA)
- 6664 07 **A self-consistent picture of wave-particle duality of light** [6664-04]
Y. Gan, Hubei Univ. (China); W. Wang, Vrije Univ. (Netherlands)

SESSION 2 THEORETICAL FORMULATIONS

- 6664 08 **Photon position eigenvectors lead to complete photon wave mechanics (Invited Paper)**
[6664-05]
M. Hawton, Lakehead Univ. (Canada)
- 6664 09 **Einstein's dream (Invited Paper)** [6664-06]
A. Khrennikov, Univ. of Växjö (Sweden)
- 6664 0A **Light quantum from classical electromagnetic theory (Invited Paper)** [6664-07]
W.-L. She, Sun Yat-Sen Univ. (China)
- 6664 0B **Single photons cannot be extracted from the light of multi-atom light sources (Invited Paper)** [6664-08]
K. O. Greulich, Fritz Lipmann Institute (Germany)

SESSION 3 FUNDAMENTAL PROPERTIES OF PHOTONS

- 6664 0C **Do single photons tunnel faster than light? (Invited Paper)** [6664-09]
H. G. Winful, Univ. of Michigan (USA)
- 6664 0D **The lateral displacement of a moving image on transmission through a stationary glass window (Invited Paper)** [6664-10]
M. Padgett, J. Leach, S. Franke-Arnold, J. Götte, L. Allen, Univ. of Glasgow (United Kingdom); A. Wright, J. Girkin, S. Barnett, Univ. of Strathclyde (United Kingdom)
- 6664 0E **Experimental detection of photons emitted during inhibited spontaneous emission (Invited Paper)** [6664-11]
D. Branning, Trinity College (USA); A. L. Migdall, National Institute of Standards and Technology (USA); P. G. Kwiat, Univ. of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign (USA)

SESSION 4 ENTANGLEMENT, EPR, AND STOCHASTIC MODELS

- 6664 0G **Multi-photon entanglement: from quantum curiosity to quantum computing and quantum repeaters (Invited Paper)** [6664-13]
P. Walther, M. D. Eisaman, A. Némoroski, A. V. Gorshkov, Harvard Univ. (USA); A. S. Zibrov, Harvard Univ. (USA), Harvard-Smithsonian Ctr. for Astrophysics (USA), and P.N. Lebedev Institute of Physics (Russia); A. Zeilinger, Univ. of Vienna (Austria) and Institute for Quantum Optics and Quantum Information (Austria); M. D. Lukin, Harvard Univ. (USA) and Harvard-Smithsonian Ctr. for Astrophysics (USA)
- 6664 0H **What do correlations tell us about photons? (Invited Paper)** [6664-15]
A. F. Kracklauer, Bauhaus Univ. Weimar (Germany)
- 6664 0I **Fair sampling and rotational invariance in EPR experiments** [6664-16]
G. Adenier, A. Yu. Khrennikov, Växjö Univ. (Sweden)
- 6664 0J **The natural philosophy of fundamental particles** [6664-29]
R. C. Storti, Delta Group Engineering P/L (Australia)
- 6664 0K **Observation of a significant influence of Earth's motion on the velocity of photons in our terrestrial laboratory** [6664-37]
H. A. Múnera, Univ. Nacional de Colombia (Colombia) and Ciudad Univ. (Colombia); D. Hernández-Deckers, G. Arenas, E. Alfonso, Univ. Nacional de Colombia (Colombia)

SESSION 5 EXPERIMENTAL MEASUREMENTS

- 6664 0L **The Sagnac effect and the chirality of space time (Invited Paper)** [6664-17]
R. M. Kiehn, Univ. of Houston (USA)
- 6664 0M **Coherence vortex with orbital angular coherence momentum and wave-particle duality in correlation function** [6664-18]
W. Wang, M. Takeda, The Univ. of Electro-Communications (Japan)

- 6664 ON **New tests and clarification of some conceptual issues in the superposition of monochromatic light fields** [6664-19]
A. Gilra, V. Gokhroo, C. S. Unnikrishnan, Tata Institute of Fundamental Research (India)
- 6664 OO **Why Kastner analysis does not apply to a modified Afshar experiment** [6664-20]
E. Flores, E. Knoesel, Rowan Univ. (USA)

SESSION 6 RECONCILING THEORY AND MEASUREMENT

- 6664 OP **Four-dimensional photon cavities** [6664-34]
K. B. Wharton, San Jose State Univ. (USA)
- 6664 OQ **Theory and practice: How do we teach our students about light?** [6664-22]
K. Creath, Optinering (USA) and College of Optical Sciences, The Univ. of Arizona (USA)
- 6664 OR **Light and the observer: new experiments and a critique of our common beliefs about light (Invited Paper)** [6664-23]
C. S. Unnikrishnan, Tata Institute of Fundamental Research (India)
- 6664 OS **Can the 'photon interferes only with itself' hypothesis be reconciled with superposition of light from multiple beams or sources?** [6664-24]
C. Roychoudhuri, Univ. of Connecticut (USA); N. S. Prasad, NASA Langley Research Ctr. (USA); Q. Peng, California State Univ. at Northridge (USA)

POSTER SESSION

- 6664 OT **A complete description and applications for a photon** [6664-25]
Z. X. Yao, J. W. Zhong, B. L. Pan, Zhejiang Univ. (China)
- 6664 OU **Nonlocality as a function of PDE type** [6664-28]
D. Maker, Photon Research (USA)
- 6664 OV **The principle of frequency interaction and photoelectric conversion of the mass wave** [6664-31]
D. Cao, Beijing Natural Providence Science & Technology Development Co., Ltd. (China)
- 6664 OW **Photon as a classical wave packet from classically stabilized electron orbits** [6664-33]
J. O. Jonson, Stockholm Univ. (Sweden)
- 6664 OX **What is a photon?** [6664-35]
G. N. Mardari, Rutgers Univ. (USA)

Author Index

Conference Committee

Conference Chairs

Chandrasekhar Roychoudhuri, University of Connecticut (USA)
Al F. Kracklauer, Consultant (Germany)
Katherine Creath, Optineering (USA) and College of Optical Sciences,
The University of Arizona (USA)

Program Committee

Shahriar S. Afshar, Rowan University (USA)
Robert W. Boyd, University of Rochester (USA)
Benjamin J. Eggleton, The University of Sydney (Australia)
Margaret H. Hawton, Lakehead University (Canada)
Subhash C. Kak, Louisiana State University (USA)
Andrei Yu. Khrennikov, Växjö University (Sweden)
Thomas F. Krauss, University of St. Andrews (United Kingdom)
Akhlesh Lakhtakia, The Pennsylvania State University (USA)
Ashok Muthukrishnan, Texas A&M University (USA)
John M. Myers, Harvard University (USA)
Narasimha S. Prasad, NASA Langley Research Center (USA)
Michael G. Raymer, University of Oregon (USA)
Wolfgang P. Schleich, Universität Ulm (Germany)
Marlan O. Scully, Texas A&M University (USA) and Princeton University
(USA)
Wei-Long She, Sun Yat-Sen University (China)
C. S. Unnikrishnan, Tata Institute of Fundamental Research (India)
Ian A. Walmsley, University of Oxford (United Kingdom)
Herbert G. Winful, University of Michigan (USA)
Ewan M. Wright, Optical Sciences Center, The University of Arizona
(USA)

Session Chairs

- 1 Information and Wave-Particle Duality
Al F. Kracklauer, Consultant (Germany)
Chandrasekhar Roychoudhuri, University of Connecticut (USA)
- 2 Theoretical Formulations
Herbert G. Winful, University of Michigan (USA)
Margaret H. Hawton, Lakehead University (Canada)

- 3 Fundamental Properties of Photons
Wolfgang P. Schleich, Universität Ulm (Germany)
Narasimha S. Prasad, NASA Langley Research Center (USA)
- 4 Entanglement, EPR, and Stochastic Models
Andrei Yu. Khrennikov, Växjö University (Sweden)
Philip Walther, Harvard University (USA)
- 5 Experimental Measurements
Shahriar S. Afshar, Rowan University (USA)
C. S. Unnikrishnan, Tata Institute of Fundamental Research (India)
- 6 Reconciling Theory and Measurement
Katherine Creath, Optinering (USA) and College of Optical Sciences,
The University of Arizona (USA)
Wei-Long She, Sun Yat-Sen University (China)

Introduction

It is our great pleasure to bring to you the proceedings of the second biannual conference on the fundamental questions relating to the nature of light or photon. From the number of participants and overall quality of the papers, and from the wide variety of sub-fields of optics and expertise, it is clear that we have initiated a successful conference series by raising the right questions to our community.

The concept of a photon as raised by Einstein in 1905 and its mathematical formulation introduced by Dirac in late 1920s have not changed in any fundamental way over the intervening century except for being polished further, often in violation of causality and non-locality. This has been done to the point that often scientists and philosophers are willing to re-define nature's reality to conform to Einstein's and Dirac's formulations.

Yet we can notice that there is a clear sense of restlessness among a minority but an appreciable number of scientists. They have created their own platforms through books and conferences to re-visit the very foundations of 20th century physics. The books by Smolin (*The Trouble with Physics*), Robert B. Laughlin (*A Different Universe: Reinventing Physics from the Bottom Down*) and Penrose (*The Road to Reality*) are good examples. Two noteworthy conference series worth mentioning are organized by (i) the Natural Philosophy Alliance, and (ii) Växjö University, Sweden.

Collectively, we are increasingly becoming proud to intellectually live in the N-dimensional abstract space while, interestingly, our physical bodies and the engineering advancements are thriving in the culturally demeaning but causally congruent three-dimensional reality! Highly ordered, systematically logical and incessantly evolving nature does appear to us as a creative system engineer. We tend to succeed more often when we organize our thinking as humble reverse-engineers, while keeping an ambitious goal to understand all the detail processes behind all the interactions that make nature operate. In essence, the questions we as a scientific and engineering community should be asking are these: (i) Is physics heading in the right direction? And, (ii) do we really need to abandon the three-dimensional reality?

Rather than address these very broad difficult questions, our conference series is raising the more focused question, "What are photons?", by staying grounded within the causal three-dimensional reality as indicated by our technological successes through engineering thinking.

Our journey to this conference started with the 2003 October special issue, "The Nature of Light: What is a photon?" published in OSA's *Optics and Photonics*

News. The journey continued in 2005 with the SPIE conference and proceedings of the same title (Proc. of SPIE Vol. 5866). We continue to look at these questions with this second biannual conference, "The Nature of Light: What Are Photons?"

Our choice of the topic is both highly focused for the near-term and very broad for the long-term. Let us underscore the breadth first. Optics is the most important enabler of both the sciences and the technologies since ancient times. Even today the most pervasive and at many times the ultimate in precision measurement tools are provided by optics, whether it is spectroscopy, Bose-Einstein Condensation, atom optics, measuring Graviton, or the decay of protons, etc. Thus understanding the real nature of light is very critical, in not only designing precision optical instruments today, but also extending our understanding of the rules of operation (laws) of nature, and hence inventing more tools that will guide us to the next higher scientific level of understanding.

For the near-term, this conference is focusing on the engineering questions: Does the photonic energy packet propagate out as an indivisible packet like an elementary particle? Or, does it propagate out diffractively by spreading and making itself vulnerable to divisibility through diverse optical components?

For the third biannual conference in 2009, we look forward to enthusiastic participation by our current authors and their friends. We also welcome all those who read this volume and feel resonant with the idea of revisiting the century old fundamental questions regarding the real nature of the radiation packets emitted by atoms. Help us create and make the 2009 conference more effective and ambitious. Contact us with your ideas and comments ahead of time.

Chandrasekhar Roychoudhuri
Al F. Kracklauer
Katherine Creath